

## **Application for Determination**

<b>Parish</b>	Wroxham		
<b>Reference</b>	BA/2009/0110/FUL	<b>Target date</b>	14 September 2009
<b>Location</b>	Former Moore's Boatyard, Staithe Way Road, Wroxham		
<b>Proposal</b>	Mixed redevelopment comprising erection of 4 x dwellings, 1 x rebuilt office and 2 x maisonettes over, new wet boatshed, refurbishment of existing boat sheds and provision of marina services and parking		
<b>Applicant</b>	Yellow Property Services		
<b>Recommendation</b>	Refuse		

### **1 Description of Site and Proposals**

- 1.1 The application site comprises part of a former boatyard located at the end of Staithe Way Road, Wroxham. The application site measures approximately 0.62 hectares in size and is occupied by a vacant bungalow and an office building and a number of dilapidated boatshed buildings. It is accessed off Staithe Way Road and is within the development boundary for Wroxham. There are residential properties on Staithe Way Road to the south and south-west of the site, holiday accommodation to the north and boatyards to the east and west. The north-eastern part of the site (around the boatshed and office buildings) is within Flood Risk Zone 3b and the remainder in Flood Risk Zone 1, 2 and 3a.
- 1.2 There are a number of elements to the proposal:
- demolition of existing bungalow and erection of 4 x 3 bedroom dwellings; and
  - redevelopment of existing Peninsula Cottages marina office to provide small office 2 x 2 bedroom maisonettes; and
  - construction of a new wet boatshed; and
  - refurbishment of the roof of an existing open boatshed; and
  - refurbishment of the main boatyard building to provide open fronted area for winter storage, a covered area for a maintenance workshop and a workshop building.
- 1.3 It is also proposed to provide marina facilities comprising pump-out, water supply and a drainage area, whilst parking associated with the above is also proposed.

- 1.4 The application originally included the provision of a flat above the new wet boatshed, but this aspect was withdrawn, being in Flood Risk Zone 3b where the principle of new residential accommodation is unacceptable.

## **2 Site History**

The application site forms part of a previously larger site which operated as the Moore's and Co yard. The yard was subdivided in the 1980's and the north eastern part of the yard was redeveloped to provide 34 units of holiday accommodation which now forms the Peninsula Cottages development. The mooring basin within the Peninsula Cottages development was used for private moorings associated with Peninsula Cottages and for a limited number of hire vessels.

In late 2005 the holiday cottages were sold to Yellow Property Services (the applicant) and, it is understood, these have now been sold on to private owners/investors. The associated facilities and equipment required to operate a hire fleet were removed from the former Moore's site, although the private moorings remain.

In order to relocate the hire fleet from the mooring basin at Peninsular Cottages, a planning application was submitted for the change of use from private to hire boat moorings at the Powles Marina site. Planning permission was, however, refused in February 2007 on grounds of an adverse impact on the privacy and amenity of adjoining occupiers and the inadequate access to the site (05/2006/1937).

To support the relocation of the boatyard business to the Powles Marina site, an extension to the boatyard building and additional office space were permitted in 2006 (05/2006/0594).

In February 2008 a planning application was submitted for the redevelopment of the former Moore's site to provide a terrace of six x 2<sup>1</sup>/<sub>2</sub> storey residential properties on the site of the existing bungalow, plus refurbishment of the former boatyard office and recladding of the boatshed building. This application was refused in April 2008 on the grounds that it was not a comprehensive scheme.

## **3 Consultation**

Wroxham Parish Council – No objection subject to Environment Agency and Highways Authority being satisfied respectively over flood risk and access.

Hoveton Parish Council – No comments received.

District Member (Cllr Chris Green) – No comments received.

District Member (Cllr David Teager) – No comments received.

Broads Society – No objection. Pleased to see retention of boatyard facilities although no information provided to support economic viability of scheme. Attention should be paid to materials on new residential units to ensure that these are compatible with terraced properties locally.

Highways Authority – Objection on grounds of inadequate access and highway safety on Staithe Way Road.

Water Management Alliance – No objection.

Environment Agency – Objection on grounds of flood risk.

Two letters of concern from neighbouring properties regarding parking, access, drainage and sewer provision, safety of fuel provision, surface water drainage and impact on amenity of the holiday cottages, height to new residential units and impact on neighbouring amenity

One letter from neighbouring business clarifying that footpath shown on plan is not a public right of way, but is available for owners of Peninsula Cottages only

## **4 Policies**

### **4.1 National Planning Policy**

PPS1 – Sustainable Development

PPS25 – Development and Flood Risk

<http://www.communities.gov.uk/planningandbuilding/planning/planningpolicyguidance/planningpolicystatements/planningpolicystatements/>

### **4.2 Broads Core Strategy adopted September 2007**

CS 1 Landscape protection and enhancement

Development and changes in land use / management must ensure that all aspects of the environmental and cultural assets of the Broads distinctive landscape are protected, enhanced and restored.

Proposals should ensure opportunities for positive impacts on the following core assets have been addressed and adverse impacts avoided:

- (i) the defining and distinctive qualities of the varied landscape character areas formed by the built and natural environment;
- (ii) tranquillity and wildness as part of the Broads experience;
- (iii) the value and integrity of nature conservation interest ;and
- (iv) the character, appearance and integrity of the historic and cultural environment.

Opportunities to mitigate the visual impact of currently intrusive features should be sought.

### CS9 Sustainable Tourism

The Broads landscape is partly man-made and is constantly changing. There will continue to be opportunities to create new environmental and cultural assets on any scale of development and these will be sought where they:

- (i) create new high quality land and water-based landscapes which reflect the essential Broads characteristics, offering biodiversity gains through habitat creation and opportunities to improve facilities for navigation and recreation;
- (ii) improve the quality of the built environment;
- (iii) involve, for all new developments, good quality design, the use of sustainable construction methods and the use of locally sourced materials;
- (iv) incorporate crime reduction measures in line with “Secured by Design”;
- (v) protect, maintain and enhance the nature conservation value of the Broads paying attention to habitats and species;
- (vi) contribute to ecological networks and create habitat corridors, especially linking fragmented habitats of high wildlife value;
- (vii) encourage and facilitate the development of alternative and more sustainable solutions to flood risk and alleviation, taking into account the likely changes as a consequence of climate change.

### CS22 Economy

In order to support and strengthen the local and rural economy, sites and properties in employment-uses will be protected from redevelopment resulting in a loss of employment by:

- (i) supporting and promoting appropriate diversification, subject to there being no consequent adverse local impacts;
- (ii) strengthening a skilled workforce in the marine and tourism industries and in specialist craft skills on which the distinctive character of the Broads relies ; and
- (iii) supporting and promoting employment in nature conservation.

## 4.3 Broads Local Plan 1997 (Saved Policies)

### Policy EMP 5 Development at boatyards

Within existing boatyards, the development of new boatsheds and other buildings to meet the operational requirements of the boatyard will be permitted.

The development of new buildings or uses for other employment purposes within boatyard sites will be permitted provided that:

- a) the proposals are part of a comprehensive scheme for the boatyard; and
- b) the development would involve a subsidiary part of the yard; and
- c) the site is large enough to accommodate the different uses in a manner which would not conflict with each other, and would not have a significant adverse effect on adjoining uses and occupiers; and

- d) there would not be a significant adverse effect on the Broads landscape, waterways, wildlife or built environment.

In determining proposals, the Authority will have particular regard to the objective of retaining existing moorings, other boatyard facilities and access to the waterfront.

#### Policy H 8 Boatyard sites within the development boundaries

Within the development boundaries as defined on the Proposals Map Insets, development of new dwellings for permanent residential or holiday accommodation on boatyard sites will be permitted if all of the following criteria are met:

- a) the proposals are part of a comprehensive scheme for the boatyard; and
- b) the residential or holiday accommodation development would involve a subsidiary part of the boatyard's existing site area. Development involving the whole or major part of a boatyard will not be permitted; and
- c) the site is large enough to accommodate the different uses in a manner which would not conflict with each other or with surrounding uses; and
- d) the scale, design and external materials of the development would be appropriate to the character and appearance of the site and the area.

In determining development proposals at boatyards, the Authority will have regard to the economic viability of the existing boatyard and to the effect which the proposed development would have on facilities for visitors and the objective of retaining existing moorings and access to the waterfront.

#### Policy B 11 Design

Development will only be permitted if its scale, form, design, external materials and colour would be appropriate to its setting. New development in the built environment should respect the character and townscape of the area. New development in the countryside should be appropriately located so as to minimise its visual intrusion in the landscape.

#### Policy TC 8 Parking, servicing and other highway requirements

New development involving the erection of buildings, or the extension or material change of use of existing buildings will be required to make provision for car, moped, motorcycle and cycle parking and servicing in accordance with the standards set out in the parking guidelines of the appropriate County Council as Highway Authority. Standards for developments not listed in the respective guidelines will be determined in consultation with the appropriate Highway Authority taking into account the nature of the development.

Additional traffic likely to be generated by a proposed development must be capable of being accommodated on the existing local road network without prejudicing road safety or the access of any adjoining occupiers.

Where appropriate, as part of redevelopment proposals, the Authority will require the retention of an existing car park or an existing level of on-site

parking provision where this meets the functional needs of a local service, business or visitor facility.

## 5 Assessment

- 5.1 The main issues in the determination of this application relate to the principle of the use, the design of the buildings, the flood risk and highways matters, including access and parking.

### The principle of the use

- 5.2 This application is a resubmission of a scheme (BA/2008/0077/FUL) which was previously refused planning permission on the grounds of it not being a comprehensive scheme, but being primarily housing-driven. The differences between the schemes are as set out below:

<u>Building/Use</u>	<u>Existing use</u>	<u>2008/0077</u>	<u>2009/0110</u>
Bungalow (16)	Vacant	6 dwellings	4 dwellings
2 storey building (8/15)	Peninsula Cottages office ground floor + flat above	Refurbish building, including frosted glass to windows	Rebuilt to provide Peninsula Cottages office ground floor + 2 maisonettes
Boatshed building (1/2/3)	Vacant	Reclad	Refurbished to provide secure workshop (1), open fronted workshop (2), open fronted area for winter storage (3)
Boatshed building offices (5/13)	Vacant	Reclad	Refurbished to provide offices
Covered wet moorings area	Covered wet moorings area	Wet boatshed	New wet boatshed (6) (flat (17) removed)
Covered wet moorings (12)	Covered wet moorings	Covered wet moorings	Covered wet moorings
Covered wet moorings (10)	Covered wet moorings	Wet boatshed	Marina services – fuel, water, pump-out
Quayheading (11)	Private moorings	Private moorings	Marina services for berth holders

- 5.3 Whilst the above demonstrates that much of the site is currently vacant, the site itself is an interesting one, which has been the subject of cumulative change over the last 20 years. Originally the application site formed part of a much larger boatyard site and had been used variously for boat manufacture, as a hire yard and for private moorings. Over time it has been incrementally

redeveloped, crucially in the 1980's with the removal from boatyard use of the northern part of the site to the holiday accommodation at Peninsula Cottages and, subsequently, the loss of the hire fleet. Extensions to the buildings were permitted in 2006 in order to support the viability of the yard. However, the buildings have sat vacant for at least the last three years and are deteriorating; the bungalow is unoccupied. The only operation on the site is the Peninsula Cottages office which handles the administration for the holiday properties.

- 5.4 In support of the revised scheme the agent has submitted information outlining the costs of the proposed refurbishment of the boatshed buildings, and advises that the housing element on site is required as proposed in order to underwrite the costs of the boatshed refurbishment and to make the entire scheme viable. He has also submitted correspondence from a local operator indicating an interest in leasing the main boatshed building following refurbishment, subject to terms. He states that advice from a local chartered surveying company indicates that the buildings are not marketable in their current condition.
- 5.5 Development plan policy seeks to support and maintain the remaining boatyards in the Broads as essential to the functioning and character of the area, and in order to achieve this, policy EMP5 of the adopted Broads Local Plan permits development at boatyards – primarily the development of new boatsheds and other buildings, although this may include redevelopment and alteration of existing buildings – to ensure their viability through investment and growth. The policy requires that such development is part of a comprehensive scheme and would involve a subsidiary part of that yard and would not prejudice the boatyard use.
- 5.6 Policy H8 of the adopted Broads Local Plan similarly refers to redevelopment at boatyards. It recognises the pressure for higher-value land uses such as housing on these often attractive waterside sites and requires the submission of a comprehensive scheme where the development of housing is proposed, requiring that this comprise a subsidiary part of the site and should not be prejudicial to the retention of a boatyard facility.
- 5.7 It is recognised that the submitted scheme and its renewal components demonstrates a greater commitment to the boatyard aspects of the site than the previous scheme, which proposed only superficial works; the submission of estimated costing for the refurbishment and indication of interest from prospective tenants similarly is useful. The fact does, however, remain that the works to the boatyard buildings, welcome as they are, comprise only refurbishment to make good the damage occurring as a consequence of lack of maintenance and that the bulk of the meaningful work is on the only part of the site which is not constrained by flood risk (and consequently by PPS25) and which could, therefore, alternatively accommodate a mixed use scheme and this is proposed for redevelopment to create general market housing. The general market housing does not contribute to the tourist economy as, for example, does the Peninsula Cottages development on a formerly

redeveloped part of the site, but instead reduces the potential for the site to sustain itself by limiting its options and potentially prejudicing its viability.

- 5.8 Whilst the proposals to refurbish the buildings are welcome, it has not been demonstrated that this could not be achieved by means other than through redevelopment for housing of a substantial part of the site, nor that there is no market for any use of the buildings as they stand. It is accepted that they are not of a modern, industrial standard. However, many boatyards around the Broads operate from facilities which have an 'historic' character and this does not impede their commercial viability – indeed as a means of keeping overheads low such facilities may be attractive to smaller operators. Alternatively, a lesser refurbishment or refurbishment on a phased basis could be a cost effective way of bringing the buildings back into use without the need for a housing development to fund the proposal. It is also noted that since acquiring the site the owners have separated off both the Peninsula Cottages development and the hire fleet, both of which could have contributed to the maintenance of the viability of the site and thereby avoided the need for the justification of general market housing to fund the scheme.
- 5.9 On balance, whilst the revisions to the previous scheme are noted, it is considered that the application falls short of a comprehensive scheme and continues to represent a housing-driven approach with remedial works only to the boatyard buildings. The remaining boatsheds and the land occupied by the office and bungalow represent the last opportunity to retain a genuine boatyard-related use on this site – something which has not been secured through previous consents as the schemes which have been permitted have not been comprehensive. An alternative scheme might be considered which includes boat-related and water-compatible uses on that part of the site within Flood Risk Zone 3b and which supports and enhances the remaining boatyard use, whilst including a mixed use on the remainder of the site which might, conceivably, include some housing if this did not compromise commercial operations on the site.
- 5.10 On this basis it is considered that the submitted scheme is contrary to adopted Broads Local Plan policies EMP5 and H8 and is therefore not acceptable in principle.

### Design

- 5.11 The scheme for the four new residential dwellings details a terrace of two and a half storey units linked by single garages with terraces above. Of a modern style and using traditional brickwork plinth with cedar cladding above and grey cement slates to the roofs, the scheme is broadly acceptable in terms of mass, scale and design.
- 5.12 The proposed refurbished buildings similarly utilise traditional materials of profiled steel, render and wood cladding and are acceptable in principle.

### Flood Risk

- 5.13 The Flood Risk Assessment submitted in support of the application indicates that the northern part of the site is within Flood Risk Zone 3b, which is defined as the functional flood plain. Within this area where only water-compatible uses are appropriate under PPS25 no major development is proposed, only refurbishment. On this basis, there is no objection in planning terms.
- 5.14 The proposed housing development is located on higher land within Flood Risk Zones 1 and 2 and, on this basis, there is no objection subject to planning conditions covering finished floor levels and the preparation and adoption of a flood response plan to cater for future changes in flood risk, and the submission of details pertaining to surface water drainage.

### Access and Parking

- 5.15 Access to the site is off Staitheway Road, itself accessed from the A1151 from The Avenues. Staitheway Road is a narrow, residential road with limited forward visibility at the junction with The Avenues and no passing provision or footways. Notwithstanding the previous permitted use, the Highways Authority has consistently recommended refusal of any proposal which would be likely to result in an increase in traffic using Staitheway Road on grounds of the adverse impact on highway safety. The Highways Authority raise an objection to the proposal on the grounds that it would intensify use of Staitheway Road and the proposal is therefore contrary to Policy TC8.
- 5.16 The proposal provides limited parking in the form of six on-site parking spaces for the proposed six new dwellings. The proposed dwellings are family houses and it is likely that each property would be reasonably expected to generate more than one vehicle per household. Wroxham benefits, however, from good public transport links which offer alternative means of transport and the Norfolk County Council Parking Standards require a maximum of two spaces per dwelling to be provided. There is no minimum requirement however, and there is therefore no objection to this aspect of the proposal when considered against Policy TC8. As proposed, the business element of the site would generate no additional traffic and accordingly there are no highways issues pertaining to this.

## **6 Conclusion**

- 6.1 This is a disappointing scheme on a site which has the potential to continue to contribute to the boatyard economy of this part of the Broads. It is accepted that the site is constrained by the requirements of PPS25, but this does not justify developing the more developable part of the site for housing and, indeed, makes it even more important that a sensitive and comprehensive scheme is put forward which supports and enhances the retention of the boatyard on the site. This scheme does not achieve this and therefore cannot be supported.

## 7 Recommendation

That planning permission be refused on grounds of conflict with adopted Broads Local Plan Policies EMP5, H8 and TC8 and adopted Core Strategy DPD Policies CS1, CS9 and CS22.

Background papers: Application File BA2009/0110/FUL

Author: Cally Smith  
Date of Report: 24 September 2009

List of Appendices: Site Location Plan

**BA/2009/0077/FUL - Boatyard, Staithe Way Road, Wroxham**  
**Mixed development of 6 no residential units and refurbishment of boat shed exterior**

