

**Feedback from Navigation Appointment Process**  
Report by Chief Executive and Administrative Officer

**Purpose:** Following the recent appointments to the Navigation Committee a few areas for improvement were highlighted in the appointment process. The Committee is asked for its views on the bodies which should be consulted on the appointments. Other matters are for the Committee's information.

**1. Introduction**

- 1.1. The recent recruitment of co-opted members to the Navigation Committee was a successful process and the overall standard of the candidates who applied was extremely high. As a four yearly process it is important to review the procedures followed now and address any areas for improvement. These can be adopted for the next recruitment in four years' time.
- 1.2. The appointment process for co-opted members follows due process and adopts the guidance on public appointments. [The Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act 1988](#) specifies certain requirements when appointing members to the Navigation Committee.

**2. Process**

- 2.1. The recent recruitment process was initiated due to the term period for the previous cohort of co-opted members ceasing on 31 March 2019.
- 2.2. Members of the Navigation Committee were informed of the commencement of the appointment process at the 6 September 2018 Navigation Committee meeting. The eight vacancies were advertised on the Broads Authority website and a job advert was placed on the Eastern Daily Press job page. The vacancies were also advertised in the September 2018 edition of Broadcaster which was sent to all registered toll payers.
- 2.3. The application documentation was made available on the Broads Authority website and included a job description and person specification. The deadline for applications was the end of October 2018.
- 2.4. In November the appointment panel met to shortlist the applications received. The panel consisted of one of the Broads Authority's independent persons who acted as the panel chair, the Chief Executive of British Marine, the President of the Norfolk and Suffolk Boating Association, and the Broads Authority Chair.

- 2.5. Interviews were held across three days and consisted of each applicant giving a short presentation on a topic of their choosing.
- 2.6. The Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act 1988 categorises the types of organisations that are to be consulted on the appointments:
- a) two shall be appointed after consultation with such bodies appearing to the Authority to represent the owners of pleasure craft available for hire or reward as it considers appropriate;
  - b) one shall be appointed after consultation with such bodies appearing to it to represent nationally the owners of private pleasure craft as it considers appropriate;
  - c) one shall be appointed after consultation with such bodies appearing to it to represent the owners of private pleasure craft which use any part of the Broads as it considers appropriate;
  - d) two shall be appointed after consultation with such bodies appearing to it to represent persons who are likely to be required to pay ship, passenger or goods dues imposed by it as it considers appropriate;
  - e) one shall be appointed after consultation with such bodies appearing to it to represent other users of the navigation area as it considers appropriate.
  - f) one shall be appointed after consultation with the Great Yarmouth Port Authority.
- 2.7. The user organisations identified in Appendix A were contacted for their involvement in the process. Those that responded were sent a list of the shortlisted candidates for comment.
- 2.8. The panel met to determine their recommendations for the eight appointments to the Navigation Committee, considering the comments received from the user organisations.
- 2.9. Members of the Navigation Committee were consulted on the recommended appointments at the 17 January 2019 Navigation Committee meeting. Those members involved in the appointment process did not participate in the discussion.
- 2.10. The appointments were confirmed at the 1 February 2019 Broads Authority meeting.

### **3. Areas for improvement**

- 3.1. Members of the panel and the existing co-opted members were contacted for their feedback on the recent appointment process. Their responses have been incorporated into the areas identified below as requiring improvement.

## 3.2. Consultation with user organisations

3.2.1. Of the 30 organisations contacted nine responded that they wished to be included in the consultation, and only six of these returned comments on the shortlist sent to them. It has been noted by one of the members of the panel that in previous years of recruitment only a minority of the user organisations has ever participated in the consultation process.

3.2.2. For the recent consultation, the user organisations that responded were sent a list of the shortlisted names; feedback the panel received from the consultees has said that this was insufficient information and can be confusing if the applicants have similar names.

3.2.3. It also became apparent that some of the user organisations had disbanded since the appointment process was conducted in 2014. These changes are displayed as tracked changes in Appendix A.

## 3.3. Great Yarmouth Port Authority

3.3.1. Correspondence with the Great Yarmouth Port Authority revealed that they had an outdated understanding of the Navigation Committee appointment process. It is worth noting that this is the only organisation referred to by name in the Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act 1988.

## 3.4. Consultation with the Navigation Committee

3.4.1. The Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act 1988 states that the committee is to be consulted before appointing any member of the Navigation Committee. Four of the existing members were involved in the recent appointment process and so were unable to participate in the consultation. This left minimal members to consult on the shortlist. This raises the question, at what point in the process is it most appropriate to consult the Committee on its own appointments. It is always likely that existing members of the Committee will be applicants, so the number of members available for consultation will be an issue at any stage.

## 3.5. Other feedback received

3.5.1. Feedback from the panel has suggested making provisions for panel member absences. The suggestion was to include a relevant substitute to replace an appointed panel member depending on when the unavailability is known. However, the panel would proceed without a substitute if the absence was unforeseen.

3.5.2. It has also been suggested that precise dates of interviews be published to applicants to avoid issues with applicant absences.

3.5.3. Feedback received from an existing co-opted member has suggested that the process for co-opted members re-applying for appointment be clarified.

## 4. Recommendations

- A. The Members of the Navigation Committee are asked for their views on the list of user organisations to be consulted on the appointments and officers then provide a revised list to the Broads Authority for approval. Officers will re-write the detailed instructions for the process clarifying when in the process this consultation is conducted and what information the organisations receive on the candidates. This is likely to require an amendment to the application form requesting consent from the applicants for their data to be shared with these organisations.
- B. Improved communication with Great Yarmouth Port Authority about the appointment process. Membership and/or staff of the Great Yarmouth Port Authority and other user organisations could change in a four-year period, communication needs to be maintained during this period to ensure understanding of the processes. In the case of the Great Yarmouth Port Authority this could be achieved with the co-opted member appointed under category f.
- C. The recommendation of one of the Panel Members is accepted, that given the very limited involvement of the Great Yarmouth Port Authority (GYPA) in management of the Broads, particularly since the transfer of responsibility for Breydon Water, it is also recommended to the Authority that their right of GYPA to consultation be reviewed when the 1988 Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act is next amended.
- D. To confirm that the Navigation Committee is consulted on the appointments at the shortlisting stage.

## 5. Conclusion

- 5.1. The recommendations in this report are for information only, any additional comments from members of the Navigation Committee will be presented to the Broads Authority to adopt any changes for future appointments. A copy of the appointment process is included at Appendix B.

Background papers:	None
Author:	John Packman/Sarah Mullarney
Date of report:	28 May 2019
Broads Plan Objectives:	None
Appendices:	Appendix A - List of user organisations consulted Appendix B – Navigation Committee Co-opted Member Appointment Process



**List of organisations to be consulted on the appointments to the Navigation Committee and the relevant paragraph under Section 9 of the 1988 Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act**

~~Anglers Angling~~ Trust (E)  
 Association of Freight Transport (D)  
~~British Canoe Union~~ (B)  
 British Marine Federation (A, D)  
 British Marine Federation – East Anglia (D)  
 British Rowing (B)  
 British Waterski (B)  
 Broads Angling ~~Strategy Services~~ Group (E)  
 Broads Canoe Hire Association (A)  
 Broads Hire Boat Federation (A, D)  
 Broads Reed and Sedge Cutters Association (D, E)  
~~Canoe England~~~~British Canoeing~~ (E)  
 Chamber of Shipping (D)  
 East Anglian Waterways Association (C)  
 Eastern Region Rowing Council (C, D)  
 Eastern Rivers Ski Club (C, D)  
 Great Yarmouth Port Authority (F)  
 Great Yarmouth Port Users Association (D)  
 Hickling Windsurfers (E)  
 Hoseasons Holidays Ltd (A, D)  
 Inland Waterways Association (B)  
 Inland Waterways Association – Eastern Region (C, D)  
 National Association of Boat Owners (B)  
~~Norfolk Anglers Conservation Association~~ (E)  
 Norfolk and Suffolk Anglers' Consultative Council (E)  
 Norfolk and Suffolk Boating Association (C, D)  
 Norfolk and Suffolk Pleasure Boat Owners Association (A, D)  
 Norfolk Broads Day Boat Owners Association (A)  
 Passenger Boat Association (D)  
 Royal Yachting Association (B)  
 RYA – Eastern Region (D)  
 Sport England (E)  
 Suffolk County Amalgamated Angling Association (E)  
 Transport on Water Association (D)  
 UK Windsurf Association (E)

**Categories:**

A = such bodies appearing to the Authority to represent the owners of pleasure craft available for hire or reward as it considers appropriate;

B = such bodies appearing to it to represent nationally the owners of private pleasure craft as it considers appropriate;

C = such bodies appearing to it to represent the owners of private pleasure craft which use any part of the Broads as it considers appropriate;

D = such bodies appearing to it to represent persons who are likely to be required to pay ship, passenger or goods dues imposed by it as it considers appropriate;

E = such bodies appearing to it to represent other users of the navigation area as it considers appropriate; and

F = after consultation with the Great Yarmouth Port Authority.

## Navigation Committee Co-opted Member Appointment Process

Date	Task	Notes
Aug/Sept	Prepare Documentation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Application Form</li> <li>• Notes for Guidance</li> <li>• Appointment Process</li> <li>• Job Description</li> </ul>
Aug/Sept	Contact Selection Panel Members re process: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• BA Independent Person (Panel Chair)</li> <li>• British Marine</li> <li>• NSBA</li> <li>• BA Chair</li> </ul>	
September	Advertise Vacancies	EDP – job advert Navigation Committee page/BA job vacancy page Broadcaster
October	Deadline for receipt of applications	Applications to be sent to <a href="mailto:committees@broads-authority.gov.uk">committees@broads-authority.gov.uk</a>
November	Shortlisting by Selection Panel	Day to be arranged for selection panel to meet to shortlist received application forms.
November	Interviews	
December	Consultation with user organisations on recommendations	Letters to be sent to all user organisations to ask if they wish to be involved in the consultation process.  Those that wish to be consulted to be sent a list of the shortlisted candidates for comment.  These comments are forwarded to the selection panel for consideration as part of their recommendations for appointment.

**Navigation Committee Co-opted Member Appointment Process**

<b>Date</b>	<b>Task</b>	<b>Notes</b>
<p><b>January</b> <b>Navigation Committee</b></p>	<p>Navigation Committee – consultation on appointments</p>	<p>A report goes to Navigation Committee with a list of the recommended candidates for appointment.</p> <p>Any potential new members are invited to attend this meeting to meet the existing members and to observe proceedings.</p>
<p><b>March</b> <b>Broads Authority</b></p>	<p>Appointments confirmed by Broads Authority</p>	<p>Co-opted members are officially appointed at the BA meeting.</p>
<p><b>April</b> <b>Navigation Committee</b></p>	<p>Appointed Co-opted Members attend first Navigation Committee Meeting</p>	<p>The first Navigation Committee meeting prior to the annual Broads Authority meeting. This enables the Navigation Committee to appoint a Chair and Vice Chair and recommend two co-opted members to the Broads Authority.</p>