

Consultation on the Appointments to the Navigation Committee
Report by Selection Panel Chair & Independent Person

Purpose: In accordance with the provisions in the Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act 1988 the Authority shall consult the Navigation Committee before appointing any member of the Navigation Committee.

1 Introduction

- 1.1 The appointment process for the co-opted members of the Navigation Committee is conducted on a four yearly basis and as additionally necessary to fill any casual vacancies on the committee. Terms of appointment are for four years with a maximum aggregated term of eight years.
- 1.2 The membership of the current co-opted members is due to end March 2019; this has prompted the recruitment process for the next term period to fill the eight vacancies on the committee.

2 Appointment Process

- 2.1 Details of the vacancies were advertised on the Broads Authority's website, on the Navigation Committee page and the jobs page. They were also advertised on the Eastern Daily Press jobs page and featured in a special edition of Broadsheet which was sent to all toll payers in October 2018. The closing date for applications was Friday 19 October 2018.
- 2.2 In total, 28 applications were received by the closing date; these were subsequently shortlisted to 15 candidates by the Selection Panel. The selection panel comprised:

Christine Lee – Panel Chair (one of the Authority's two Independent Persons)
Richard Card – President, Norfolk and Suffolk Boating Association
Lesley Robinson – Chief Executive, British Marine Federation
Haydn Thirtle – Chairman, Broads Authority
- 2.3 The 15 shortlisted candidates were interviewed over several days in November, on Monday 19th, Wednesday 21st, and Monday 26th. As part of the interview, candidates were required to give a short presentation to the panel on a topic of their choice relating to the Broads and Navigation interests.
- 2.4 Candidates were assessed and scored on the following criteria:

- Knowledge of the Broads and its special qualities as a protected landscape;
- Knowledge of the navigation area and current relevant issues;
- Knowledge of the varied recreational uses of the Broads;
- Knowledge of the boating industry;
- Ability to think strategically;
- Understanding of appropriate governance and organisational arrangements. Ability to think independently.
- Demonstration of Broads Authority Core Values.

2.5 Each candidate was scored on the above values (maximum 5 points, minimum 1 point per value) by each panel member, with the scores being ultimately entered into an overall comparison matrix.

3 Consultation

3.1 As part of the appointment process, 30 organisations were contacted for their inclusion in the consultation process in accordance with paragraph 9 of the Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act. A list of these organisations can be found in Appendix 1. Nine of these organisations confirmed they wished to be consulted and were subsequently sent a list of the 15 shortlisted candidates for comment.

3.2 The panel met on 4 December 2018 to review the six comments received from the consulting organisations and to make a final list of the eight candidates they recommend for appointment.

4 Recommendations

4.1 The Selection Panel has agreed to recommend that the following candidates be appointed to the Navigation Committee in 2019:

Categories:

Category A - such bodies appearing to the Authority to represent the owners of pleasure craft available for hire or reward as it considers appropriate:

Andrew Hamilton

Simon Sparrow¹

Category B - such bodies appearing to it to represent nationally the owners of private pleasure craft as it considers appropriate:

Nicky Talbot

¹ Simon Sparrow's previous appointment was for an agreed term of two years to bring the position in line with the four yearly appointment process.

Category C - such bodies appearing to it to represent the owners of private pleasure craft which use any part of the Broads as it considers appropriate:

Paul Thomas

Category D - such bodies appearing to it to represent persons who are likely to be required to pay ship, passenger or goods dues imposed by it as it considers appropriate:

Linda Aspland

Mike Barnes

Category E - such bodies appearing to it to represent other users of the navigation area as it considers appropriate;

John Ash²

Category F - after consultation with the Great Yarmouth Port Authority.

Alan Thomson

5 Summary

- 5.1 From the initial 28 applications, 13 candidates were not asked to interview. Of those 13, three were judged by the panel to not on the face of it meet all the core criteria set out in 2.4 above, and ten to have provided insufficient information on which to form a judgment. 15 shortlisted applicants were invited to interview. The overall standard of the shortlisted applications was very high. It was therefore a challenging task for the Selection Panel to reduce the shortlist of 15 applications to the selected eight candidates for appointment.
- 5.2 In this task, the Selection Panel was guided by a systematic approach to the scoring process to ensure that each candidate was scored in a transparent and fair way. Due to an important unforeseen circumstance, Lesley Robinson was unable to attend the interviews scheduled for 21 November, resulting in four the candidates being interviewed by the three remaining members of the selection panel. All four members of the panel agreed to continue with the affected interviews in Lesley's absence. Each candidate's score was converted into a percentage and candidates ranked accordingly in order to provide the eight individuals to be recommended for appointment. The scores process and final recommended list was discussed by the panel at its meeting on 4 December. Lesley Robinson made no judgment on any individual not interviewed by her.

² John Ash is currently appointed to the Broads Authority as a Secretary of State member, his current term ceases on 31 March 2019, prior to the appointment start date for the Navigation Committee co-opted members.

- 5.3 The shortlisting and interview process were thorough, and designed to ensure that all the candidates were given equal opportunity. This was enhanced by the Selection Panel members, three of whom were external to the Broads Authority.
- 5.4 Recommendations for appointment by the Selection Panel will be considered by the Broads Authority at its meeting on 1 February 2019.

Author: Christine Lee/Sarah Mullarney
Date of report: December 2018

Appendices: APPENDIX 1 – List of Organisations Consulted

List of organisations to be consulted on the appointments to the Navigation Committee and the relevant paragraph under Section 9 of the 1988 Norfolk and Suffolk Broads Act (as amended by the Navigation Committee on 4 September 2014)

| Organisation | Category |
|--|-----------------|
| Angling Trust | E |
| Association of Freight Transport | D |
| British Marine Federation | A,D |
| British Marine Federation – East Anglia | D |
| British Rowing | B |
| British Waterski | B |
| Broads Angling Services Group | E |
| Broads Canoe Hire Association | A,D |
| Broads Hire Boat Federation | A,D |
| Broads Reed and Sedge Cutters Association | D,E |
| British Canoeing | E |
| Chamber of Shipping | D |
| East Anglian Waterways Association | C |
| Eastern Region Rowing Council | C,D |
| Eastern Rivers Ski Club | C,D |
| Great Yarmouth Port Authority | F |
| Great Yarmouth Port Users Association | D |
| Hickling Windsurfers | E |
| Hoseasons Holidays Ltd | A,D |
| Inland Waterways Association | B |
| Inland Waterways Association – Eastern Region | C,D |
| National Association of Boat Owners | B |
| Norfolk and Suffolk Anglers' Consultative Council | E |
| Norfolk and Suffolk Boating Association | C,D |
| Norfolk and Suffolk Pleasure Boat Owners Association | A,D |
| Norfolk Broads Day Boat Owners Association | A |
| Passenger Boat Association | D |
| Royal Yachting Association | B |
| RYA – Eastern Region | D |
| Sport England | E |
| Suffolk County Amalgamated Angling Association | E |
| Transport on Water Association | D |
| UK Windsurf Association | E |